



Environmental, Gender and Social Impact Analysis (EGSIA) and the development of a Risk Management and Sustainability Plan (RMSP) for the programme Sustainable Development of the Area of Aragvi Protected Landscape and the Local Communities

Determination/validation of the Programme's logframe
indicators



CONSULTANT

Integra Consulting s.r.o.
Sudoměřská 1243/25
Prague 3
130 00
Czech Republic

IČ: 275 66 617
DIČ: CZ275 66 617
office@integracons.com
+420 774 541 484



Naviga Advisory and Evaluation s.r.o.
Křižíkova 2987/70b
Brno
612 00
Czech Republic

IČ: 25342282
DIČ: CZ25342282
gill@navigae.cz
+420 603 535 132



Authors of the report (in alphabetical order):

Dita Jahodová, Nino Javakhishvili, Irakli Kobulia, Lukáš Maláč,
Michal Musil, Martin Smutný, Tamar Tskhadadze

CLIENT

Czech Development Agency
Nerudova 3
118 50 Prague 1
Czech Republic

+420 251 108 130
info@czechaid.cz

Table of Contents

1	Background and context	4
1.1	Objectives of the assignment	4
1.2	Purpose of the determination/validation of the Programme's logframe indicators ..	4
1.3	Approach.....	4
2	Revisions of the logframe.....	6
2.1	Objectives	6
2.2	Results.....	15
3	Potential additional objectives and indicators	23

1 Background and context

This final report on the ‘Determination/validation of the Programme’s logframe indicators’ represents the output of the fourth phase of the project ‘Environmental, Gender and Social Impact Analysis (EGSIA) and the development of a Risk Management and Sustainability Plan (RMSP) for the programme Sustainable Development of the Area of Aragvi Protected Landscape and the Local Communities’ (hereinafter also ‘EGSIA Aragvi’). The final version reflects the feedback on the draft report received from the Czech Development Agency.

1.1 Objectives of the assignment

The assignment ‘Environmental, Gender and Social Impact Analysis (EGSIA) and the development of a Risk Management and Sustainability Plan (RMSP) for the programme Sustainable Development of the Area of Aragvi Protected Landscape and the Local Communities’ aims to carry out a participatory assessment of the development programme implemented jointly by Czech Development Agency and Austrian Development Agency in Dusheti Municipality, Georgia (hereinafter also the ‘Programme’). The assignment should ensure that any substantial negative environmental, gender and/or social risks and/or adverse impacts are avoided, minimized, mitigated and managed, and that environmental, gender and social opportunities and benefits are enhanced. The findings and conclusions of the assignment will also serve for validating the logframe indicators of the programme as well as all baseline and target values for these indicators.

1.2 Purpose of the determination/validation of the Programme’s logframe indicators

The purpose of this task is to revise the Programme’s logical framework (hereinafter also ‘logframe’) indicators and proposed its modifications as well as to determine the baseline values for the objectively verifiable indicators. The key deliverable of this fourth phase of the EGSIA Aragvi is the updated set of Programme logframe indicators with proposed baseline values and additional comments regarding both the baseline and target values data sources.

1.3 Approach

The process for the revision of the Programme’s logframe indicators was integrated in all key project components and draw from associated outputs and deliverables in the following manner:

- The review of available data, data gaps and actual information value of the existing indicators for the Programme was carried during the baseline study (output 1 of the EGSIA Aragvi) including consultations with the Programme management, and other relevant stakeholders.
- The EGSIA (output 2 of the EGSIA Aragvi) further facilitated the discussion about the necessary changes of the logframe indicators in order to properly reflect EGSIA findings regarding the existing environmental, gender and socio-economic problems and the likely impacts of the Programme on those problems.
- The EGSIA process and subsequent Risk Management and Sustainability Plan (output 3 of the EGSIA Aragvi) also generated additional suggestions for the modification of the indicators

2 Revisions of the logframe

This section contains proposed modifications of the current Programme logframe including baseline values (2018) and the potential data source for determining the future values (in 2023).

It needs to be pointed out that the indicators for Overall Objective and the Specific Objectives are measurable only by specific studies (i.e. by the recent EGSIA, mid-term evaluation or external monitoring survey in 2023, and end-line evaluation in 2024). Also, a majority of the indicators on the level of the results is measurable only in the end of each calendar year (e.g., income from agriculture/tourism, cut meadows cut etc.).

2.1 Objectives

Objectives	Objectively verifiable Indicators (OVI) – according to logframe	Objectively verifiable Indicators (OVI): Recommended adjustments according to the findings of the baseline study (new definitions or changes are highlighted by red font).	Baseline situation (2018) including the source of data	Potential data source for determining the future situation (2023)	Comments
To contribute to sustainable development of the area	Number of people living in the region permanently or seasonally	<i>Recommended new definition:</i>	1 433 (Source: Descriptive statistics,	Ad-hod household survey	Only minor refinement of the original indicator stressing the fact that people actually

of Aragvi Protected Landscape and to improved livelihoods of the local communities		Number of people living households that receive any sort of income from within the region, permanently or seasonally ¹	household survey) ²	Descriptive statistics provided by municipality	living in the region should be counted.
	-	<i>Recommended new indicator:</i> Number of people living in households designated as socially vulnerable	253 ³ (Source: Descriptive statistics, household survey)	Descriptive statistics provided by municipality	Suggestion of a new indicator focusing on trends of socially vulnerable households.
	Specific objective 1				

¹ The aim of the reformulation is to quantify residents who are economically active inside the region, disregarding of the seasonality – and to distinguish them from people who only visit the region for holidays or commute for work outside of the region. Before the new formulation is finalized a in-depth discussion is necessary as to the inclusion of pensions as well as self-subsistence farmers (who only have limited income from sale of their surplus).

² According to the household survey, ca. 83.8 % of respondents did have an income from within the region (including pensioners). According to municipal data there are 610 households with 1715 residents (2.81 persons / household). Therefore, ca. 511 households should be economically active (or receive pension) within the region, thus the value 1433 people.

³ 259 persons (15 % of overall population) in 2022; according to household survey an increase of 2.2 % between 2018 and 2021, thus baseline is 253 people.

The economic situation of the local population, men and women, is improved in particular through sustainable development of tourism and agriculture	Percentage of entrepreneurs managing permanent and/or temporary farms or other enterprises which provide for a sustainable livelihood	<p><i>Recommended new definition:</i></p> <p>Percentage of households whose main source of income is agricultural production and are not designated as socially vulnerable⁴.</p>	43.2 % (Source: household survey) ⁵	Ad-hod household survey	Breaking of the original indicator into these two categories is recommended due to the definition of “entrepreneurs”, which is not clear cut, especially among residents. Some understand that if they sell some of their surplus at the market, they are entrepreneurs, while others do not. For that reason, we did separate income from agriculture from entrepreneurship as such.
---	---	---	--	-------------------------	---

⁴ Indicator needs to be split into two – self-subsistence farmers rarely see themselves as entrepreneurs. The “sustainability” of their farming needs to be operationalized. In this we suggest the criterion of socially vulnerable status. However, other approaches may be discussed, such as average monthly income threshold (e.g. 600/1000 GEL?) or minimal monthly income from sale of agricultural production. Last option is to formulate the indicator as “whose economic status has improved since 2018”, however, no baseline can be set up for such formulation. To be discussed in more depth at later stages.

⁵ 51.8 % if socially vulnerable households are also counted.

		<p><i>Recommended new definition:</i></p> <p>Percentage of households with at least one entrepreneur (outside agriculture) that are not designated as socially vulnerable⁶</p>	17.5 % (Source: Household survey) ⁷	Ad-hod household survey	Ditto. Breaking the original indicator into two will increase the quality of data – we will not have the entrepreneurs mixed up with self-subsistence farmers who just sell their surplus on the market.
	Percentage of persons (women and men) with enhanced incomes through agricultural production	Percentage of households whose income from agricultural production has been increased.	0 (hereinafter: indicator focuses on the increase compared to baseline of 2018, hence baseline is 0 and endline will be a positive –	Ad-hod household survey	In order to enhance quality of data, the various economic activities were separated (agriculture, traditional crafts, tourism). In line with good practice of other programmes the gender-specific aspect of the indicator is stressed by the means of gender disaggregation. Since households are our key measurement unit in the
		Therein: Percentage of households whose income from agricultural production has been increased where the primary breadwinner is a woman			

⁶ Similar approach to “sustainability” as in previous case.

⁷ 19.6 % if socially vulnerable households are also counted.

			or negative – percentual change expressing the share of respondents who recorded an increase.		household survey, households where women are the key breadwinner are used to operationalize the disaggregation.
		Percentage of households whose income from traditional crafts and products has been increased	0 (See above)	Ad-hod household survey	
		Percentage of households whose income from traditional crafts and products has been increased where the primary breadwinner is a woman			
		Percentage of households whose income from tourism services has been increased	0 (See above)	Ad-hod household survey	
		Percentage of households whose income from tourism services has been increased-where the primary breadwinner is a woman.			

	Percentage of entrepreneurs, running a business providing for a sustainable livelihood, who are	Share of entrepreneurs on total population	1.94 % ⁸	Descriptive statistics provided by municipality	We suggest firstly express the total share of entrepreneurs on population and then express the share of disadvantaged groups on this number – provides a
	women, persons with disabilities, youth or persons from remote communities to land, other productive resources and inputs, knowledge, financial services, markets and opportunities for value addition and non-farm employment.)	Percentage of entrepreneurs running a business who are women, persons with disabilities, youth or persons from remote communities (residing in a community whose distance from the main road exceeds 5 km) on total number of entrepreneurs.	to be completed	Descriptive statistics provided by municipality	higher quality data. We also suggest to omit the stress on “providing sustainable livelihood” from the definition – this cannot be directly operationalized and could be robustly taken into account only if a much profound data collection is conducted (focusing on the economy of individual entrepreneurs), which would unnecessarily burden the respondents, in effect lower the response rate without clear benefit. Instead we would rely on the data collection method for

⁸ According to municipal data: 2.3 % recently; according to household survey a 29.4 % increase between 2018 and 2021, hence 1.94 %.

					this indicator to take into account the element of “sustainable livelihood”: Municipal data are collected in cooperation with local representatives who only calculate residents who are economically active.
Specific objective 2					
The quality of education and social services in the region is enhanced	Percentage of households with children at school age who are enrolled at local schools	<i>Recommended new definition:</i> Percentage of children age 6-18 who are enrolled at local schools and/or participate in courses that are organized in schools (in person as well as online)	166	Statistics provided by schools	Refined definition – also to include other education activities at schools.
	Percentage of medical cases treated locally	<i>Recommended new definition:</i> Percentage of respondents who required medical assistance in the previous year and express sufficient or mostly sufficient access to appropriate health care locally.	90.6 % (Source: Household survey)	Ad-hod household survey	Reformulated so that the effect of eventual support might be better captured.

	Percentage of people in need of social services who actually benefit from them	Share of households in which at least one member requires specific care due to age and/or disability and are in need of additional assistance on total number of households with at least one member who requires specific care	57.7 % (Source: household survey)	Ad-hod household survey	Reformulated so that the effect of support is well captured – support will not focus on social services as such, but should relieve some of the care for elderly/disabled in the region.
Specific objective 3					
Good local governance and sustainable management of the Aragvi Protected Landscape are ensured, while participation of local people belonging to the groups	Percentage of local people who feel involved in the local decision making	Percentage of local people who feel that their involved in the local decision making compared to the time before the establishment of the LAG and Aragvi Protected Landscape Board has increased	0 (Hereinafter: the indicator measures a change compared to baseline of 2018, baseline is therefore 0)	Household survey	Marginally revised so that the effect of support in the form of a change of perception is seen – similar also below.
	Percentage of local people belonging to the groups which tend to be under-	Percentage of local women who feel that their involvement in local decision making has	0		Similar reformulation as above.

which tend to be under-represented in the decision-making process is enhanced	represented (women, persons with disabilities, youth, persons from remote communities) involved in the local decision making	increased compared to the time before the establishment of LAG and APL Board			
		Percentage of people with disabilities, youth or persons from remote communities (residing in a community whose distance from the main road exceeds 5 km) who feel that their involvement in local decision making has increased compared to the time before the establishment of LAG and APL Board	0		Similar reformulation as above; women and other disadvantaged groups counted separately.

2.2 Results

Results	Objectively verifiable Indicators (OVI) according to logframe	Objectively verifiable Indicators (OVI): Recommended adjustments according to the findings of the baseline study ⁹ (new definitions or changes are highlighted by red font).	Baseline situation (2018)
1.1.1 Tourism infrastructure is enhanced	Km of tourist trails marked	Km of tourist trails marked with the support of the Programme	0
1.1.2 The offer of tourism services is enhanced"	Number of guesthouses and campsites providing at least basic services for tourists	Number of guesthouses and campsites providing at least basic services for tourists supported by the Programme ¹⁰	0

⁹ General remark for discussion regarding "result" indicators collected on the basis of : These indicators are closely related to implemented projects and should be monitored by reporting of project beneficiaries. For that purpose, the indicators should be generally related to beneficiaries. If it is required that any of these data are collected in the region as whole, it should be moved to specific objective indicators.

¹⁰ If requested to monitor the overall trend of number of guesthouses and other accommodation, it should be moved to objectives level. However, it is questionable why the number of guesthouses and other facilities that start their operation without any support from the programme should be monitored. Similar in the case of other result indicators.

	Number of different means of transport offered to tourists	Number of various services provided to tourists with the support of Programme	0
	Income from sales of traditional souvenirs	Annual revenues from sales of souvenirs, crafts and other traditional products by producers who received support from the Programme.	19,000 GEL (total income of 4 supported beneficiaries)
1.1.3 More tourists visit the region	Number of tourists visiting the region	Number of tourist overnights in local guesthouses supported from the programme. ¹¹	305
	Number of local guides who speak English , acquired comprehensive knowledge about the region and adopted key skills on how to treat a tourist	Number of local guides trained with the support of programme who acquired sufficient level of skills and knowledge to provide their services to tourists, including trainings in English language.	0
1.2.1 Cattle/sheep breeding and bee keeping practice is more efficient	Income from cattle/sheep breeding and bee keeping	Average yearly income from sales of products related cattle/sheep breeding, bee keeping,	7,661.8 GEL (Average yearly income of 17 beneficiaries before support)

¹¹ If total overnights are monitored, must be moved to objective level. However, it is questionable that data from non-supported guesthouses could be collected.

		fish farming and planting of vegetables, grains and fruits by supported farmers ¹² .	
1.2.2 Grass cutting, packing and transport are more efficient	Hectares of regularly cut meadows	Hectares of meadows cut regularly by the beneficiaries	
1.2.3 Production of traditional and organic agricultural local products is enhanced	Number of local products with a regional brand certificate	<i>No change suggested</i>	0
1.2.4 Cooperation among farmers in production and marketing is enhanced	Number of functioning cooperatives	Number of economically active supported cooperatives	0
1.2.5 Knowledge and skills of local farmers are improved	Percentage of correct answers in questionnaires filled in by participants before and after a training	Number of farmers who received trainings whose knowledge or skills have been improved	0

¹² Similarly, as above, the indicator should be related to supported farmers. If we want to know the trend of all farmers in the region, it must be transferred to objective level, however, that would be rather unusual – we should monitor the increase of quality of life by farmers in the region which would be the outcome of these activities, but we can hardly attribute an increase of sales of unsupported (directly or indirectly) farmers to programme support.

2.1.1 The knowledge of the local population about their region is deepened	Percentage of correct answers in questionnaires concerning the region before and after a training	Percentage of adult male training course participants with improved knowledge.	0
		Percentage of adult female training course participants with improved knowledge.	0
	Number of children participating in courses of local dances / songs / arts	Number of children participating in courses of local spiritual and material culture supported by the Programme	0
2.1.2 The local teachers are trained, the curricula are enlarged and the equipment of schools is upgraded	Schools are equipped with audio-visual aid, computers and access to internet	Number of schools supported by equipment, including audio-visual aid, computers and/or other technical equipment (including software) as well as access to internet	0
	Number of trainings in which local teachers participated	Number of training courses in which local teachers were trained in use of provided equipment/software etc.	0
2.1.3 The knowledge of the local people about the women empowerment and prevention of gender-based violence is enhanced	Number of trainings in which local children and other persons participated	Number of informal sessions/consultations for local youth, women and men	0

2.1.4 The knowledge of local teachers, pupils and community about environmental challenges, climate change and waste reduction is enhanced	Number of lessons and workshops in which local pupils, teachers and other project beneficiaries (LAG members, rangers etc.) participated	Number of in-depth environmental training courses for limited number of local leaders (teachers/rangers/LAG members/other)	0
2.2.1 The education and skills of medical personnel are improved	Number of trainings in which local medical doctors participated	Number of training courses/workshops for medical doctors focused on the use of provided technical equipment	0
2.2.2 The availability of essential means for providing medical care is enhanced	Percentage of beneficiaries reporting to be satisfied with the provided assistance	Percentage of locals reporting improvement of local medical assistance (due to enhanced equipment of local medical personnel)	0
2.2.3 A basic social assistance and care is provided	Percentage of households who are listed as socially vulnerable is decreased due to their improved livelihoods	Number of socially vulnerable households receiving support for their self-subsistence activities and benefitting from this support	0 (Only households receiving support are calculated – therefore 0 before the programme was launched)

	Percentage of people in need of communal social services and support who actually benefit from them is increased	Percentage of people in need of informal communal services (neighbourhood assistance) and support who actually benefit from them is increased	0 (As above)
3.1.1 Proposal of management plan of the Aragvi Protected Landscape is approved	Draft management plan is agreed and submitted for approval	Draft Management Plan is submitted	0
3.1.2 Methodological materials are created	Methodical guidelines for: 1) establishment of Protected Landscape Administration, and 2) elaboration of Management Plan for Protected Landscape developed and handed over to the Ministry of Environment Protection and Agriculture of Georgia	Methodological guidelines for: 1) establishment of Protected Landscape Administration, and 2) elaboration of Management Plan for Protected Landscape have been developed.	0
3.1.3 Nature and landscape conservation capacities in	Employees of Aragvi Protected Landscape Administration periodically update Species Inventory Database	The Species Inventory Database is created and is being filled in	0

protected areas are strengthened			
3.1.4 A Local Action Group is established and functioning	The LAG is self-sustainable	The LAG is sustainable ¹³	0
	Participation of persons belonging to the groups which tend to be under-represented (women, persons with disabilities, youth and persons from remote communities) is ensured	Percentage of the LAG members belonging to the groups which tend to be under-represented (women, persons with disabilities, youth and persons from remote communities)	0
3.1.5 Introduction and operations of sustainable forest management of the Aragvi Protected Landscape"	Approved Forest Management Plan	Forest inventory is completed ¹⁴	0

¹³ The LAG has become that member of the national network (GALAG), which ensures the state support will be provided after the Programme is closed.

¹⁴ Formal approval of the FMP might be complicated due to recent legislative change (Forest Code of 2021). Progress in forest inventory is therefore better indicator of overall work progress

	Operational sustainable forest management system of Aragvi Protected Landscape	Operational sustainable forest management system based on Forest Management Plan of Aragvi Protected Landscape ¹⁵	0
--	--	--	---

¹⁵ As above – the approval and implementation of Forest Management Plan depends on external factors (uncertainty regarding the implications of new Forest Code towards the future economic productivity of the PL forests make it difficult to predict when the Forest Management Plan will be approved).

3 Potential additional objectives and indicators

The second section elaborates several suggestions for new objectives and indicators, which are based on the existing challenges identified by the baseline study and the likely impacts of the Programme analysis in the EGSIA. The suggestions below can be considered in the future amendments of the Programme and/or when preparing the framework for the follow-up support. .

Objectives/targets	Indicators
The economic situation of the local population, men and women, is improved in particular through sustainable development of tourism and agriculture	Percentage of women with income from other services for tourists (tourist guides, tourist trail markers, etc.)
	Percentage of men with income from other services for tourists (tourist guides, tourist trail markers, etc.)
The knowledge of the local people about the women empowerment and prevention of gender-based violence is enhanced	Brief guide (electronic) on how to address domestic violence and other forms of gender-based violence is created for survivors and disseminated to local people
	A suitable effective strategy for dissemination of both guides to the local population is developed
The knowledge of local people how to write project application is enhanced	Number of regular field consultations on project applications in each locality
The knowledge of local people in English is improved	Number of English courses for local people in each locality

The knowledge of local people in marketing and advertising of their products and services is enhanced	Number of training courses in marketing and advertisement for local people in each locality
The knowledge of local people in tourist guiding is improved.	Number of men who participated in the tourist guide course
	Number of women who participated in the tourist guide course
The knowledge and skills of local people in first aid is improved	Number of the training courses in first aid for local people in each locality

